U.S. FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE COURT

# UNITED STATES FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE COURT2018 JUN 13 PM 3: 05 WASHINGTON, D.C.

LEEANN FLYNN HALL CLERK OF COURT

IN RE OPINIONS & ORDERS ISSUED BY THIS COURT ADDRESSING BULK COLLECTION OF DATA UNDER THE FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE SURVEILLANCE ACT

Docket No. Misc. 13-08

IN RE OPINIONS & ORDERS OF THIS COURT CONTAINING NOVEL OR SIGNIFICANT INTERPRETATIONS OF LAW

Docket No. Misc. 16-01

#### MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE DOCKET NOS. MISC. 13-08 & 16-01

For reasons of judicial economy and to avoid unnecessary delay, Movants respectfully request that the Court join Docket Nos. Misc. 13-08 and 16-01 for resolution.

The Court has ordered the parties to brief the question of subject matter jurisdiction in No. Misc. 13-08, which was filed on November 7, 2013. *See* Mot. for Release of Court Records (No. Misc. 13-08). Presently pending before the Court is another right-of-access motion filed by Movant American Civil Liberties Union on October 19, 2016. *See* Mot. for Release of Court Records (No. Misc. 16-01). That motion seeks access to FISC opinions containing novel or significant interpretations of law issued between September 11, 2001, and the passage of the USA Freedom Act on June 2, 2015. The motion was fully briefed on the merits nearly a year ago, as of June 29, 2017. Nonetheless, no decision has been issued nor has the Court requested additional briefing from the parties on any of the jurisdictional issues raised in this proceeding.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Uniting and Strengthening America by Fulfilling Rights and Ensuring Effective Discipline Over Monitoring Act ("USA FREEDOM Act"), Pub. L. No. 114-23, 129 Stat. 268 (2015).

Because the legal issues raised by the two motions overlap extensively, including the question of subject matter jurisdiction addressed in the briefing underway in No. Misc. 13-08, Movants respectfully request that the Court join the two matters for resolution. Consideration of the two motions together will significantly promote judicial economy because it will allow both cases to be fully briefed and addressed in this Court without delay—and will avoid the need for a further round of jurisdictional briefing in No. Misc. 16-01, where the parties have not had the opportunity to address these issues. Proceeding sequentially, by contrast, will extend the timeline for resolution and add to the Court's workload. Given the similarity of the claims of access underlying both motions, consolidation will align both matters for an ultimate decision.<sup>2</sup>

#### **CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, Movants respectfully request that the Court consolidate Docket Nos. Misc. 13-08 and 16-01 for resolution.

Dated: June 13, 2018

David A. Schulz
Hannah Bloch-Wehba
John Langford
Media Freedom & Information
Access Clinic\*
Abrams Institute
Yale Law School
P.O. Box 208215
New Haven, CT 06520

Phone: (203) 436-5827

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Patrick Toomey

Patrick Toomey
Brett Max Kaufman
American Civil Liberties Union
Foundation
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor
New York, NY 10004

Phone: (212) 549-2500 Fax: (212) 549-2654 ptoomey@aclu.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Movants conferred with the government concerning this motion to join the two matters. The government indicated that it opposes consolidation.

<sup>\*</sup> This motion has been prepared with the assistance of Yale Law School student, Christine D'alessandro. The motion does not purport to present the institutional views of Yale Law School, if any.

Fax: (203) 432-3034 david.schulz@ylsclinics.org

alex.abdo@knightcolumbia.org

Alex Abdo Jameel Jaffer Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University 475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302 New York, NY 10115 Phone: (646) 745-8500 Arthur B. Spitzer
Scott Michelman
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation
of the District of Columbia
915 15th Street NW, 2nd Floor
Washington, D.C. 20005
Phone: (202) 457-0800
Fax: (202) 457-0805
aspitzer@acludc.org

Counsel for Movants

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Patrick Toomey, certify that on this day, June 13, 2018, a copy of the foregoing motion was served on the following persons by the methods indicated:

### By email and UPS delivery

Maura L. Peterson
Litigation Security Group
U.S. Department of Justice
2 Constitution Square
145 N Street, N.E.
Suite 2W-115
Washington, DC 20530
Maura.L.Peterson@usdoj.gov

## By email and UPS delivery

Jeffrey Smith Counsel, Appellate Unit U.S. Department of Justice National Security Division 950 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20530 Jeffrey.Smith5@usdoj.gov

## By email and UPS delivery

Laura Donohue Georgetown University Law Center 600 New Jersey Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20001 ldk@georgetown.edu

/s/ Patrick Toomey
Patrick Toomey